REPORT

OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN THE SPECIALTY <u>0301000 "MEDICAL CARE"</u> <u>QUALIFICATION 0301013 "FELDSHER"</u> OF WEST KAZAKHSTAN HIGHER MEDICAL COLLEGE LLP FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES IN MEDICAL AND PHARMACEUTICAL SPECIALTIES OF TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME BY SPECIALTY

period of external expert evaluation: from 7 to 9 April 2021

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 8 dated March 11, 2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct external evaluation procedures within the framework of institutional and specialized accreditation from April 07 to April 09, 2021 of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" (hereinafter referred to as the college) in the following composition:



Chairperson of the External Expert Commission TOKBERGENOVA GULMIRA TELMANOVNA, Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, excellence in health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Director of LLP "Higher Medical College "Interdent" tel.: +77016557484, e-mail: tokberg enova@bk.ru.





OLEINIKOVA TATIANA ANATOLIEVNA, Ph.D., Head of Education Quality Management Department Educational and methodical management, associate professor of the department

FME "Kursk State Medical University" Tel.: + 7 (919) 272 22 74, e-mail: <u>ol_tanja@mail.ru</u>



National academic expert

KUMAROVA ALTYNAI BALTABAYEVNA, Deputy Director for teaching and educational work SPE on REM "Taldykorgan Higher Medical College" tel .: +77058881798, e-mail: <u>altynay_kumarova@mail.ru</u>



National academic expert

ABZHANOVA ZHANAR SOLTANOVNA, Deputy Director for Scientific and Methodological work LLP "Republican Higher Medical College" tel .: +7 7475576783, e-mail: <u>z.abzhanova@mail.ru</u>



National academic expert EVDOMASHCHENKO TAMARA VITALIEVNA, general practitioner, teacher of special disciplines MSE "Kostanay Higher Medical College" Health Department of Akimat of Kostanay region tel .: 8776 702 85 85, e-mail: tamaradubina@mail.ru



Expert - employers' representative ESLYASHOVA DINA MURATOVNA, chief nurse SPE on REM "City Polyclinic No. 2", Uralsk Tel .: 87058112598, e-mail: dina_mirkiyasova@mail.ru



Expert - student representative BASEROV RUSLAN BEKTEMIROVICH, 4th year student in the specialty "Medical care" PI "Ural Medical College" Maksat " Tel .: 8 776 2267153, e-mail: <u>basirov.ruslan@list.ru</u>



ECAQA Observer

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care".

tel .: +7 747 5609212, e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director General No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of the specialty 0301000 "Medical care" for compliance with the accreditation standards of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education (hereinafter - the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improving the educational programme.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" and the educational programme

West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College is one of the oldest educational institutions in the country. The history of the West Kazakhstan Medical College begins in 1916. At the end of 1916, the newspaper "Uralskiy Listok" published an announcement: "Zemskaya feldsher-obstetric school opens in the city of Uralsk on November 1, 1916, the course of training for feldshers - 3 years, for feldshers-obstetricians - 4 years. Scholarships are awarded for the best students".

On the instructions of the All-Russian Central Executive Committee on May 14, 1923, the Ural Feldsher-Obstetric School was transferred to the city of Orenburg, where it remained until 1929 and received the name of the "Kazakh Regional Medical College".

In 1929, the medical college was again transferred to the city of Uralsk.

Since 1954, the name of the Feldsher and obstetric school has changed again, it was renamed into a medical school. This name survived until June 14, 1996. Since 1996, this educational institution has been called the "West Kazakhstan Medical College".

For more than a century of its existence, the educational institution has trained and graduated more than 23,000 mid-level medical workers in the following specialties: dentists, Feldshers, midwives, children's nurses, sanitary Feldscher, dental technicians, dental assistants, Feldsher, laboratory assistants, nurses. More than 2,000 graduates received honors diplomas. Some of them received higher medical education, became scientists and heads of medical services and departments.

Other graduates successfully work in various medical and medical institutions in our country and abroad (Cuba, Germany, USA, Canada, Israel, etc.)

In various years, famous scientists worked - academician K. Zhumaliev, I.M. Malecha, Z.M. Rachmanin, F. Ya. Tripurov, A.A. Koblik, as well as doctors known in Kazakhstan - surgeon N.T. Alibaev, infectious disease specialist K.D. Tazhimanov, S.A. Lebedev, obstetrician-gynecologist I.I. Berlyand, S.P. psychiatrist Pisman, I.S. Edelzon, T.V. Cheusov, V.O. Miller, L.N. Anshakova and Dr.

There are many scientists among our graduates, whose names are known throughout Kazakhstan:

Imasheva Rozaliya Galievna - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Academician - a graduate of our educational institution, the first Kazakh woman, a child psychiatrist, worked at the Alma-Ata State Medical Institute.

Zhumatov Hamza Zhumatovich - Soviet virologist, Academy of Medical Sciences of the USSR, studied in 1929 at the Kazakh Regional Medical School.

Karakulov Ishanbai Karakulovich - studied at the Kazakh Regional Technical School in 1929 - 1931. - a famous Soviet epidemiologist, organizer of public health, a corresponding member of the Academy of Medical Sciences of the USSR, Kazakh SSR, Honored Scientist of the Kazakh SSR, Karakalpak SSR.

Tyurin Nikolai Alekseevich - in 1939 he entered the Feldsher department of the Ural dental school. In August 1941, when he was 18, he went to the front. In 1952 he graduated from the Moscow Medical Institute, worked in Moscow at the Peoples' Friendship University named after Patrice Lumumba, was the dean of the medical faculty, doctor of medical sciences, academician.

The leaders of the educational institution were: G.I. Koltsov (1916-1920), A.V. Genke (1920-1922), V.S. Ponomarev (1922), I.V. Stepanov (1922-1923), M.A. Kutin (1923-1924), M.T. Batalov

(1924-1931), I.S. Zobnin (1931-1932), I.Z. Shnibekov (1932-1936), M. Sundetkaliev (1937-1938), E.A. Shipulin (1937-1938), M.G. Sokolov (1938-1940), P.A. Pryanin (1940-1941), R.S. Podolskaya (1941-1944), E.I. Shchelkov (1944-1954), N.T. Alibaev (1954-1960), A.V. Tikhonov (1960-1979), A.N. Ibatov (1979-1984), M.K. Bergen (1984-2012). They worked hard and left an indelible mark on the development of the regional health care sector and in the training of medical personnel. Since 2012, the college was headed by N. M. Shumbalov, candidate of medical sciences, associate professor of the Department of Social Hygiene and Health Organization, who for many years previously worked as head of the department, dean, vice-rector of the West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after M. Ospanov in Aktobe, "Excellence in Education", "Excellence in Health care of the RK"

Since 2018, the college has been headed by Irmenov Kamidolla Mutigollaevich, candidate of medical sciences, honorary professor of the NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU, who has been the head of health care in EKR for more than 10 years.

The legal address of the college: 090009, West Kazakhstan region, Uralsk, Zhangirkhana, 67. Phones: 8 (711) 2-24-31-34, email address<u>https://www.zko-medcollege.kz/</u>Founder - EKR Health Department. The legal address of the founder: 090000, Uralsk, Dostyk avenue, house 201.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Certificate of accreditation of educational programme 0301000 "Medical care" for the period 31.05.2016 - 01.06.2021, Registration number SA No. 0006/1.

2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College LLP for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of organizations of technical and vocational education (hereinafter - Accreditation Standards)

The College Institutional Self-Assessment Report is 132 pages long, including 16 pages of appendices.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness based on the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, and the internal consistency of information provided by the accredited college.

Self-assessment of the college and the educational programme was carried out on the basis of the order on the formation of the composition of the internal self-assessment commission No. 735 dated 12/08/2020. The self-assessment process was carried out collegially, based on the principles of openness, transparency and transparency. Responsible for institutional and programmatic self-assessment is Almagambetova Gulmira Ibragimovna: Deputy Director for Academic Affairs.

The reliability of the information in the report was confirmed by:

1.Zh.T. Isimova - Head of the TCS "General Humanitarian and Social Disciplines"

2.M.T.Tarzhmanova - head of the TCS "General professional disciplines"

3.V.P.Kurnoskina - Head of the Department of Clinical Administration No. 1 "Special Clinical Disciplines"

4. N.V. Trunova - Feduleeva - Head of the Department of Clinical Administration No. 2 "Special Clinical Disciplines"

Educational activities in the specialty 0301000 "Medical care", qualification 0301013 "Feldsher" is carried out on the basis of a state license issued by the Department for Control in Education of the West Kazakhstan region of the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the date of issue of the license is from 30 March 2018, license number KZ79LAA00011389.

According to the standard admission rules for training in the educational institution of TVE, persons with a general secondary education who have successfully passed the entrance exams are allowed to master the EP 0301000- "Medical care" with the qualification 0301013 "Feldsher". Training on this educational programme is full-time, full-time, the language of instruction is Kazakh and

Russian, the term of study is 2 years 10 months. Educational curriculum 0301000 - "Medical care" corresponds to the mission and goals of the West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College, focused on training competitive specialists through the introduction of new priority projects in the field of medical education, the development of social partnership and the principles of dual education.

In the 2020-2021 academic year, in the specialty "Medical care", the educational process is carried out by 73 full-time teachers, 8 part-time teachers from practical health care bases. Out of 73 full-time teachers, 19 have a pedagogical education, 54 have a medical education. The average age of teachers is 40 years. 11 young specialists have up to 3 years of experience, 37 have 3 to 10 years of experience, 13 have 10 to 15 years of experience, 12 have more than 15 years of experience. The quality composition at this accredited time is 40%. The list of basic medical organizations is approved by agreements between the college and the Moscow Region and includes 41 medical organizations in Uralsk and EKR.

Currently, there is a great need for personnel of the qualification "Medical care" - "Feldsher". In the 2019-2020 academic year, the contingent of the educational programme "Medical care" - "Feldsher" amounted to 175 people under the state order, 148 people on a contractual basis. The college consults with the EKR Health Department on the need for nursing staff, which collects applications from medical organizations. The number and composition of admitted students is determined by the college based on the analysis of the employment of graduates.

The college is implementing a dual training programme: in the 2018-2019 academic year, 25 students; in the 2019-2020 academic year, 19 students of the specialty "Medical care", qualification "Feldsher" passed the programme with elements of dual training at the regional station of ambulance and emergency care with compensation payment. The college has trained 91 mentors under the national mentor training programme.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the college educational programme contains objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards.

The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards. Description of the key activities of the college fairly complete and updated software the number of students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, knowledge and skills assessment results, material and technical base, contractual obligations with partners, financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 9 accreditation standards includes a description of strengths and areas for improvement.

The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

3. External expert evaluation

3.1. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the institutional assessment of the WKHMC (hereinafter referred to as the college) was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director General of NEI "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 8 dated 11.03. 2021) and according to the program and schedule approved on March 15, 2021 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the chairperson of the EEC Ph.D. Tokbergenova G.T. and director Irmenov K.M. An external expert evaluation of institutional accreditation for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education (TVE) ECAQA began on March 15, 2021.

To obtain objective information on expert evaluation, the EEC members used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with students, observation,

study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, online questioning of teachers and students during the period from 04/05/07/04/2021, a review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of educational and methodological documents for accredited educational programmes.

On the part of the college staff, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites is ensured (Attachment 1).

The first day of the visit is 7.04.2021.

The first day of the EEC began with a visit to the college and getting to know the management. An overview presentation of the college was presented. Further, an interview with the leadership on the mission, strategic development of the organization as a whole and educational direction took place. At 9.30 a meeting of the EEC with the academic leadership took place, at which the management of educational programmes, career guidance, student recruitment, and monitoring of employment were discussed. At 10.05 and 10.40 an interview with the management of the college departments and the heads of the educational advisory point. We discussed with the managers the issues of development, approval and implementation of EP, control and measuring tools for assessing knowledge, skills and abilities of students, analysis of software effectiveness. An interview on educational and social work with students took place at 11.15. AT 12. 10 responsible staff members gave a tour of the college. EEC visited a simulation centre, a medical office, a gym and an assembly hall. In the museum, 1st and 2nd year students of "Medical care" were introduced to the history of the college in English and Kazakh. At 14.40 EEC visited the library of the college and got acquainted with the library fund. At 15.10 an acquaintance with the information support department took place, studied educational platforms, a test fund. At 15.45, the EEC members discussed administrative and economic issues with the responsible structures. At 16.15 a demonstration of teaching methods was presented, in the form of a presentation, used in educational programmes. At 4.45 pm, the QA inspector acquainted the EEC members with the college personnel policy, the recruitment of teachers, staff development and the assessment of the college staff. Q 17. 10 interviews were held with college teachers on the ZOOM platform, issues of the EP and its implementation were discussed. After that, the EEC members held a meeting on the first day of the visit. Summed up the results of the external assessment, discussed the results of the standards validation and verification of the data of the EP self-assessment reports. The day passed calmly, without stress, without deviations from the schedule, thanks to the well-coordinated work of the college staff.

Second day of visit 8.04.2021

The second day of work of EEC began with a visit to the clinical bases of the college. We visited the SEP on the REM City Multidisciplinary Hospital, on the basis of which there are 2 study rooms, talked with the leadership on the issues of clinical practice of students. In the regional multidisciplinary hospital, they visited 4 classrooms equipped with phantoms and educational material. At 11.00, we attended a demonstration of students' practical skills using simulation equipment, mannequins, phantoms in training programmes. At 11.50, the EEC members got acquainted with the material base of educational programmes: classroom fund, laboratories, classroom equipment, IT equipment. At 12.30, members of the EEC studied the college documents they requested. The documents were provided immediately, without delay. T 14. 05 Attended the final international conference of students' search and research work in cooperation with the Kazan Medical College. At 14.45 we continued the study of documents on the college EP: constituent documents, regulations on the organization of the educational process, on divisions, job descriptions, reports. At 15.45 an interview with students took place, where training programmes were discussed. The students were very active and open in communication. At 4:50 pm, members of the EEC held an interview with student activists. At 5.15 pm, we conducted interviews with employers from practical healthcare on the ZOOM platform, discussed issues of employment of graduates and the degree of satisfaction with students' knowledge. At 18.00, members of the EEC discussed the fruitfulness of the day passed and summed up

the results. 45 Continued the study of documents on the EP of the college: constituent documents, regulations on the organization of the educational process, on divisions, job descriptions, reports. At 15.45 an interview with students took place, where training programmes were discussed. The students were very active and open in communication. At 4:50 pm, members of the EEC held an interview with student activists. At 5.15 pm, we conducted interviews with employers from practical healthcare on the ZOOM platform, discussed issues of employment of graduates and the degree of satisfaction with students' knowledge. At 18.00, members of the EEC discussed the fruitfulness of the day passed and summed up the results. 45 Continued the study of documents on the EP of the college: constituent documents, regulations on the organization of the educational process, departments, job descriptions, reports. At 15.45 an interview with the students took place, where the training programmes were discussed. The students were very active and open in communication. At 4:50 pm, members of the EEC held an interview with student activists. At 5.15 pm, we conducted interviews with employers from practical healthcare on the ZOOM platform, discussed issues of employment of graduates and the degree of satisfaction with students' knowledge. At 18.00, members of the EEC discussed the fruitfulness of the day passed and summed up the results. where training programmes were discussed. The students were very active and open in communication. At 4:50 pm, members of the EEC held an interview with student activists. At 5.15 pm, we conducted interviews with employers from practical healthcare on the ZOOM platform, discussed issues of employment of graduates and the degree of satisfaction with students' knowledge. At 18.00, members of the EEC discussed the fruitfulness of the day passed and summed up the results. where training programmes were discussed. The students were very active and open in communication. At 4:50 pm, members of the EEC held an interview with student activists. At 5.15 pm, we conducted interviews with employers from practical healthcare on the ZOOM platform, discussed issues of employment of graduates and the degree of satisfaction with students' knowledge. At 18.00, members of the EEC discussed the fruitfulness of the day passed and summed up the results.

Third day of visit 09.04.2021

The third day of work of the EEC began with an introduction to the interaction of the college with Kazakhstani universities and international cooperation in the context of additional education and EP. We studied the documents: contracts, memorandums, membership in the association and the results of cooperation. At 9.30 am we got acquainted with the work of the department of applied bachelor's degree, a presentation was made. At 10.30 am Continued to study the documents on the EP of the college. At 11.00 We attended lessons in the specialty "Medical care". At 11.30 we studied the documents on the college EP: contracts with clinical practice bases, personnel policy, portfolios of teachers and students, etc. At 14.00, the final discussion of the results of the external assessment of the college EP for compliance with accreditation standards, filling out the quality profile and external evaluation criteria. Discussion of recommendations for improvement for the college. The Chairperson conducted a final open vote on college recommendations and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. A draft report and a recommendation for improving the organization's performance were prepared.

At 17.00, the chairperson and members of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment as part of the college's accreditation for 8 educational programmes for the management and staff of the college.

The programme and schedule of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the college staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

3.2 Results of the survey of key stakeholders

The ECAQA observer conducted an online survey of college students on the resource https://webanketa.com/ from April 7-9, 2021. In total, the proposed questionnaire contains 39 questions, including an assessment of satisfaction with training and resources of the organization. The

total number of students to whom the questionnaire was sent is 499. The total number of respondents is 499.

By specialties: "Medical care" qualification "**Feldsher'' - 44.2%**, qualification "Midwife" - 10.14%, "Hygiene and Epidemiology" - 23.91%, "Nursing" - 19.57 %, "Laboratory diagnostics" - 15 "Pharmacy" - 2.17%. Fully agree with the statement that they will recommend college as an organization of training - 86.23%, partially agree with this statement - 10.87%, disagree with the statement 0%, doubted the answer 2.9%. Programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems of students associated with studying in college - 86.96% of respondents strongly agree, 9.42% - partially, strongly disagree - 2.17%, the rest doubted the answer - 1.45%. According to 84.06% of respondents, programme managers and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies, the rest answered differently (they do not involve - 2, 17%, I do not know anything about it - 9.42%, doubted the answer - 0.72%, sometimes 3.62%). Fully satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, college auditoriums 84.78% of respondents, partially satisfied 12.32%, not satisfied 0.72%, partially dissatisfied - 1.45% and doubted with the answer 0.72%.

The college has created conditions for students to rest and eat (recreation areas, benches on the territory, buffet) in between classes - 79.71% agree completely, the rest of the respondents are not satisfied to some extent. Office equipment (computers, laptops, printers) are available for students in classrooms and practice bases are fully available for 86.23% of students, partially for 7.25%, not available for the rest of the respondents. The majority (88.41%) answered that teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. In the opinion of 87.68% in the college there is access to the participation of students in research work, 6.52% partially agreed with this, and the rest - 2.17% deny it. Fully and partially satisfaction with library resources 89.13% and 10.87%, respectively. The majority (91.3%) have access to electronic educational resources. The availability of medical services for a college student is characterized as sufficient by 89.86% of surveyed students. 89.86% are completely satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators and tutors, partially - 5.8%, are not satisfied in one way or another - 4.34%, 0% do not know their mentor / curator. College teachers and staff treat students with respect - 95.65% strongly agree. Most of the respondents (90.58%) know that the college has and is implementing social programmes to support students, and 9.42% have not heard and do not know about it. The college has a career counseling service for students know about this - 87.68% of respondents. Fully agree that the college has established a system of self-study of students / pupils 86.23%, partially agree - 10.87%, the rest of the respondents disagree (2.9%), or doubted the answer. 76.09% of the respondents assessed the organization of training at the practice bases as excellent, 15.22% as good, 2.9% as satisfactory, 2.17% as unsatisfactory, and a considerable percentage of respondents - 3.62% - could not rate at all ... Approximately 84.06% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest or partially agreed with the answer (13.04%) either disagree (2.17%) or doubted the answer (0.73%). unsatisfactory - 2.17%, and a considerable percentage of the respondents - 3.62% - could not evaluate at all. Approximately 84.06% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest or partially agreed with the answer (13.04%) either disagree (2.17%) or doubted the answer (0.73%). unsatisfactory - 2.17%, and a considerable percentage of the respondents - 3.62% - could not evaluate at all. Approximately 84.06% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest or partially agreed with the answer (13.04%) either disagree (2.17%) or doubted the answer (0.73%).

More than 89.13% of the respondents are satisfied with the schedule of classes in the disciplines of the educational programme, partially - 7.97%, no - 2.9%. Fully and partially satisfied with the methods of assessing the knowledge and skills of students 85.51% and 14.49%, respectively. The content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty fully meets the expectations of the majority - 89.86%, partially - 8.7%, no - 1.45%. In the classroom, teachers use active and interactive teaching methods regularly considered by 84.78% of respondents. Sometimes -

12.32%, rarely - 0.73%, the remaining 2.17% either do not know what the question is about or doubted the answer. To the question: how often the teacher is late for the beginning of classes - 92.03% of the respondents answered that there was no such thing, 7.25% answered that sometimes, I do not know what to answer - 0.72%. According to 92, After completing classes, 75% of the students surveyed, the teachers constantly provide feedback (listens to opinions, conduct mini-questionnaires, work on mistakes), and 3.62% write that "sometimes", 1.45% answered "rarely", 2, 18% answered never. Two-thirds of the respondents - 91.3% - stated that a college teacher (mentor, curator) is an example for a student as a professional doctor, a person (ethics, communication, appearance, speech), the rest or do not agree with this - (2, 17%), doubted the answer (1.45%) and 5.08% answered "not all teachers of this college".

There is a sufficient number of patients to carry out practical activities in the chosen specialty, according to the majority - 86.96%. 87.68% of respondents like to study at this college. Experienced personally negative attitude of teachers more than 87.68% of students answered "no", 7.97% answered "it happened deservedly", 2.17% "answered yes is not fair", 2.18% answered "no answer". They are satisfied that more than 88.41% of respondents study at this particular college, partially 8.7%, do not know how to answer 1.45, but about 1.44% are either disappointed or did not know how to answer. The college leadership is available to students, according to the majority of respondents - 98.55%.

To the question "Are you currently in a scientific circle or participate in a scientific project", 71.01% answered "yes", and 18.12% - "no", the rest are in search, plan to start or do not want to do research.

93.48% of the respondents are fully confident that college allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, but 1.45% are not sure about this, 4.35% cannot yet give an answer, 0.72% want to believe it, and 0% began to doubt. 90.58% are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching in the college, partially 7.97%, 1.45% answered no.

80.43% of respondents assessed the work of the external expert commission positively, 14.49% were satisfactory, 1.45% were unsatisfactory, 3.63% doubt the answer. According to 84.78% of respondents, the accreditation of college or educational programmes is necessary, at the same time, 5.8% did not know what kind of procedure it was, 5.07% answered no, 4.35% doubted the answer. Most of the respondents answered that at different stages of preparation for accreditation, teachers involved them in different activities.

Conclusion: The external expert commission of ECAQA determined that the college has a corporate culture and ethical behavior between all participants in the educational process, as well as a developed system of mentoring and consulting students on academic and personal issues. This leads to a positive attitude of students to the place of study. At the same time, students are fully involved in the work of advisory bodies on the development of the mission, discussion of the educational programme and the educational process. High involvement of students in research work was noted. Positive feedback from social partners about the level of theoretical and practical preparedness of students during the period of industrial practice testifies to a fairly high level of quality of training in an educational institution.

Areas for improvement: it is recommended to continue to work on attracting students to develop research skills in specialized disciplines.

An online survey of 60 teachers was conducted on 12-14.04.2021, the number of respondents was 60 (according to the staffing table - 60).

Pedagogical experience up to 5 years - 26.39%, from 5 to 10 years - 25%, over 10 years - 48.61%. 94.44% are satisfied with the organization of the educational process in college, 4.17% partially, 1.39% partially disagree. In college, ethics and subordination are considered by 90.28% of respondents, and 8.33% partially, partially disagree with 1.39%. Satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in college, 88.89% of respondents are completely satisfied, 9.72% partially, 1.39% partially disagree. In the organization, there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teachers, 88.89% of respondents believe, and 11.11% - partially. In this educational

organization, I have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research in the opinion of 88.89% of teachers. The wages are completely satisfied with 88.89%, in part with 11.12%. 94.44% of teachers are completely satisfied with the work of the personnel department and personnel policy, and partly - 5.56%. During the year 54.17% of the respondents improved their qualifications in their specialty, in the near future 41.67%. More than 77.78% of respondents characterize the microclimate in the team as satisfactory, 1.39% - unsatisfactory, 0% do not pay attention to it. 20.83% are satisfied with everything. 87.5% of respondents believe that in college there is an opportunity to be realized professionally.

Of the respondents, 88.89% believe that the students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, 11.11% of teachers partially agree.

When asked if the educational organization supports my participation in conferences (international, republican), 73.61% answered that travel expenses are paid, 4.17% - only travel expenses, 1.39% answered that they prefer self-financing, 2, 78% paid only the registration fee 11.11% did not contact the management about this, 6.94% did not give an answer.

Completely according to 97.22% of respondents that students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills, 1.39% partially agree, 1.39% doubt the answer. For the theoretical part of the lesson, 80.56% of respondents spend up to 30% of the total time, and 11.11% of teachers spend 50% of the time, and 0% of respondents - about 70% of the time, almost 90% - 2.78%, no answer 5.55%, which changes the optimal balance of the organization of the educational process.

Fully satisfied with the level of prior training of students (residents) upon admission to training programmes 76.39% of respondents, partially - 23.61%. In response to the question about mentoring work, 5.56% wrote that they are mentors, 73.61% a curator, 8.33% a tutor, and 12.5% had no answer.

22.22% of the respondents are not involved in clinical work, and 61.11% believe that it is the optimal combination of teaching and clinical activities.

88.89% of respondents are aware that the college implements programmes of social support for teachers, 11.11% are not aware of this. The availability of the manual was assessed by 100% of the respondents. Teachers use different teaching methods.

This questionnaire is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the college's activities fully supported by 90.28% of respondents, and 8.33% partially, 1.39% did not answer.

Conclusions: the team has a corporate spirit and support from the management. The basic education of the entire teaching staff fully complies with the requirements for the content of student training, carried out in general, humanitarian, general professional, special disciplines and meets the goals, objectives and areas of educational activities of the college. Job descriptions of teaching staff correspond to the typical qualification characteristics of the positions of teaching staff and persons equated to them. The teachers are satisfied with the working conditions and the organization of the educational process, at the same time it is necessary to complete special disciplines with qualified teachers, to strengthen the issues of professional development.

Areas for improvement: Continue work to strengthen the teaching staff with masters, bachelors of clinical disciplines.

3.3 Conclusions of the EEC on external expert evaluation

As part of an external expert assessment of the educational programme in the specialty «"Medical care" - "Feldsher". for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards, members of the EEC were carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the educational activities of the college and the educational programme.

The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, interviews with management, employees of departments, study of documentation, during interviews with administrative workers,

interviews with students, teachers, employers, and questionnaires of 499 students, 66 teachers was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to ensure the reliability and validation of the provided college information and supporting documents for compliance with the above-mentioned ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" described his best practice in adhering to accreditation standards, during an external expert evaluation by EEC members, in addition to the 20 documents previously reviewed, additionally requested 15 documents and videos on learning resources, which made it possible to identify the conformity of the activity educational organizations to the standards of accreditation of educational programmes of TVE...

Recommendations for improving performance in implementation of the educational programme in the specialty "Medical care" - "Feldsher" LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College for compliance with Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert evaluation, were presented at a meeting with the management of the college.

On the last day of the visit, members of the EEC conducted an assessment of the compliance of the educational programme in the specialty "Medical care" - "Feldsher" according to the developed ECAQA "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards". The above document was individually completed by each member of the EEC. No comments were made by the EEC members.

The programme and schedule of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full. From the side of the staff of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College, participation of all persons specified in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the educational programmes in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, Guidelines for external evaluation of a medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College", the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis of the educational programme 0301000- "Medical care" with qualification 0301013 "Feldsher" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

External experts have obtained evidence that the mission of the college is consistent with the objectives of the country's development, the national system of technical and vocational education, the health care system and the development of human resources. During interviews with students and teachers, interviews with managers and employers, the participation of the team and the student community in the discussion of the mission and goals was established. The development and approval of the mission and vision took place in accordance with the existing procedure, which ensures the involvement of all stakeholders, both at the planning stage and in the implementation of decisions made. Student-centered and practice-oriented training of future specialists with secondary specialized education ensures the implementation of the final learning outcomes, the list of which is included in the working curricula. Students in the specialty "Medical care" are adherents of their college and are informed about the mission of the organization from the website, information boards and communication with teachers. All students are aware of the qualification requirements of the specialty from the first lesson and strive to achieve the final learning outcomes on the programme. There are no unsuccessful students in this specialty.

Strengths:

1) clear, clearly formulated mission, goals and objectives;

- 2) implemented international quality management system;
- 3) developed Strategic plan with the main directions of educational activities of the college;
- 4) broad representation in the adoption of the plan by college educators and consumers the educational process of practical health care, students, parents, transparency-based and publicly available academic policy of the college;
- 5) active and mutually beneficial integration with practical healthcare;
- 6) various types of learning outcomes.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 9 standards conform: completely - 9, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0. Standard 1: completed Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: not

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

The educational programme in the specialty "Medical careis implemented in accordance with the mission, goals and expected learning outcomes and reflects the SCES, the needs and expectations of practical health care and society as a whole. The methods used, forms of teaching and learning, as well as the content of this educational programme are based on modern principles, the participation of stakeholders from medical universities, contribute to the formation of professional competencies and determine the content, volume and sequence of training components. EEC received convincing data on the methodological support of the educational programme, the use of various teaching methods by teachers (traditional and interactive). When questioning students, a high percentage of student satisfaction with college education was found. Students of the specialty "Medical care" participate in search and research work and speak at conferences. It is in this specialty that a high percentage of employment has been noted over the past five years (95%).

Strengths:

1) qualified teaching staff;

2) educational programme in "Medical care" is developed in accordance with

with the mission, goals and expected aggregate results of students and reflects

professional standards of the future specialist;

3) the existence of mutually beneficial agreements (contracts) on cooperation between the college and practical health care;

4) active use of information and innovative pedagogical technologies, and the principles of a scientific approach, developing students' communication skills and analytical, critical thinking;

5) the quality of college education allows graduates to continue their studies at universities.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 19 standards conform:

Fully - 17, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Systematize educational planning documentation for dual education;

2) expand the catalog of elective disciplines, taking into account the needs of practical health care in the West Kazakhstan region, as well as include questions on the basics of scientific methodology with the principles of analytical and practical thinking;

3) to develop a regulation defining the procedure for the preparation, quality assessment, development and examination of educational programmes for social partners.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

The principles, methods and practice of assessing professional competencies used by the CEP guarantee openness and accessibility, ensure that students achieve the final learning outcomes and are comparable to the teaching methodology. When visiting practical classes, EEC experts found the use

of various methods and types of formative and summative assessment of the development of competencies by students (oral, written, programmed control) and their rational combination... During the interviews of students by experts, it was found that students recognize the fairness and objectivity of methods for assessing their knowledge and skills.

Strengths:

- 1) the assessment methods used in the college are reliable and valid;
- 2) unified automated system for monitoring students' knowledge;
- 3) monitoring the level of professional readiness of students at various levels of the educational process;
- 4) a consistently high percentage of progress when passing the Final Attestation;
- 5) excellent level of professional competence of the teaching staff

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 5 standards conform: completely - 4, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0. *Standard 3: completed*

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To replenish and systematize the electronic database of test items in all disciplines.

Standard 4: STUDENTS

The Higher Medical College pursues an academic policy of tolerance: openness, transparency and accessibility, both at the admission stage and throughout the entire period of study. Information on academic policy is updated annually, updated, published on the website and is publicly available. EEC experts examined the evidence on the effectiveness of the policy of attracting, recruiting and selecting students.

The HMC provides educational, methodological and social support for students, and student life is rich and varied. During the interview, the students of the department showed great activity.

Strengths:

- 1) college admission policies and criteria are objective, transparent and public;
- 2) efficient student support service;
- 3) application and use of modern educational technologies, including information;
- 4) good conditions for the realization of the creative potential and personal growth of students;
- 5) stable results of academic performance and quality of knowledge of students.

6)

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 13 standards conform:

completely -12, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0 *Standard 4: completed*

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) to intensify career guidance work with applicants.

Standard 5: TEACHERS

The educational programme is sufficiently provided with qualified teaching staff. The system of rating assessment of PP competence is functioning. A systematic process of improving the qualifications of teachers. The staff potential of the college possesses modern pedagogical technologies and methods, forms a socio-cultural and health-saving environment, creates the conditions necessary for the comprehensive development and socialization of the personality of students, contributes to the development of the educational component of the educational process, broadcasts advanced experience, actively and creatively interacts with students, which makes it possible to effectively implement professional education programmes in accordance with the requirements of the Qualification characteristics of the positions of teaching staff and the requirements for licensing of educational activities.

Strengths:

- 1) a system for the selection and placement of teaching staff in accordance with regulatory documents on personnel management procedures;
- conditions for positive personal growth of teachers and opportunities for the full disclosure of the potential for making a personal contribution of everyone to the sustainable development of the college;
- 3) an effective system of material and moral incentives for the work of teachers and staff;
- 4) active participation of college teachers and the involvement of medical school staff in the development and publications;
- 5) professional development of teachers and college staff;

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 4 standards conform:

completely - 4, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

The HMC has a well-developed material and technical base, equipped with a fund of educational, methodological, scientific literature on paper and electronic media, training, auxiliary technical means and information and communication technologies. The college conducts systematic work on the development, renewal and replenishment of the material and technical equipment for the educational programme and the introduction of new information and communication technologies in the educational process in the specialty "Medical care". Periodically conducts training of teachers with the involvement of domestic and foreign specialists.

Strengths:

- 1) an agreement with the bases of practice in the specialty "Medical care", taking into account the relevance and reform of the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- 2) conducting practical exercises at the bases of the department;
- 3) a good material and technical base and a qualified teaching staff corresponding to the State Educational Standard of Education and SanPiN;
- 4) a high assortment and selection of material and technical, informational, library resources, including in the specialty "Medical care";
- 5) constant updating of the material and technical base, including 41 contracts with bases of practice in the specialty "Medical care", taking into account the relevance and reform of the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 13 standards conform:

completely - 11, significantly - 1, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) continue work on replenishing and updating the library fund in the state and Russian languages;
- 2) supplement the library fund with electronic educational publications;
- **3)** to equip and update MTB with auxiliary and information and communication technical training aids.

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

The college has an effective monitoring system for the evaluation of educational programmes,

focused on the satisfaction of students with the received level of education. The college systematically collects, analyzes, corrects and complements the results of the feedback from teachers and students regarding the stated mission, goals, objectives and strategic plan.

Strengths:

- 1) systematic research of expectations and satisfaction of teachers, staff, students, employers;
- 2) a high percentage of satisfaction of teachers, staff, students, employers with the conditions of work organization in the college.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 10 standards conform: completely - 10, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0 *Standard 7: completed Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none*

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

The college management has a sufficient level of managerial competencies, takes responsibility for the implementation of all processes that ensure the achievement of the mission. The supervisory board of the college, through the management function, participates in the management of the college, in the development of a strategy, and takes part in the distribution of funds. In the organizational structure there is a person responsible for the management of the educational programme "Medical care", namely, the head of the department. The management system and its activities are open, transparent and accessible. So, in May 2016, the college was accredited in 4 specialties, including

"Medical care" (SA registration number No. 0006/1) The college leadership is ready and capable of change. All this together ensures the effectiveness of management activities.

Strengths:

- 1) the interest of practical medicine and the city health department in the training of qualified personnel in hygiene and epidemiology;
- 2) an international quality management system has been introduced.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 12 standards conform:

completely - 10, significantly - 1, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0 *Standard 8: completed*

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) systematize the work of the QMS.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

The HMC has a well-established and implemented system of continuous improvement of all key areas of activity, and especially educational. All goals and objectives, as well as measures for improvement and improvement are laid down in the Strategic College Development Plan. The college continuously revises the organizational and staff structure, updates the goals and functions of the strategic development plan, regulatory documents, taking into account the needs of health care and society, modernizes the material and technical base, improves modern educational technologies

and innovations in the learning process for the implementation of institutional and programmatic goals and objectives of the college, the needs of students and practical health care.

Strengths:

- 1) A recreation area has been created on the territory of the college for the purpose of organizing the rest of students outside school hours, during breaks and for organizing cultural events in the open air, WORK-zone with Wi-Fi connection;
- 2) assessment forms of graduates' knowledge introduced on the basis of international practice, skills development on simulation equipment;
- 3) Scheduled training for teachers and administrators at home and abroad.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 2, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0. *Standard 9: completed Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:*

1) find funds for the acquisition and implementation of an electronic catalog;

2) introduce digitalization at the level of the educational and clinical centre (document flow, KZUN).

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme in the specialty 0301000 "Medical care" qualification 0301013 "Feldsher":

- 1. Continue updating the material and technical base of the college.
- 2. Constantly update the library fund of the college in the specialty "Medical care" with modern educational literature, in the state and Russian languages.
- 3. Strengthen international cooperation in the field of medical care.
- 4. To strengthen the scientific research work of students in the specialty "Medical care" with efficiency in the form of publications and speeches.
- 5. To systematize educational planning documentation for dual education.
- 6. Expand the catalog of elective disciplines, taking into account the needs of practical health care.

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members came to a unanimous opinion to recommend the Accreditation Council to accredit educational programme in the specialty 0301000 "Medical care" Qualification 0301013 "Feldsher" LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" as corresponding to the Accreditation Standards for a period of 5 (five) years.

Председатель Внешней	Токбергенова
экспертной комиссии	Гульмира Тельмановна

Зарубежный эксперт

Олейникова Татьяна Анатольевна

Национальный академический эксперт

Кумарова Алтынай Балтабаевна

Национальный академический эксперт

Абжанова Жанар Солтановна

Евдомащенко Тамара

Национальный академический эксперт

Экспертпредставитель здравоохранения

Есляшова Дина Муратовна

Экспертпредставитель студентов

Наблюдатель от ЕЦА

Басеров Руслан Бектемирович

Витальевна

Умарова Макпал Альдибековна

Alour

Attachment 2

			Evaluation			
Standard	Criteria for evaluation Number of standards = BS * / SU		Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	9 = 9 BS 0 SU	9			
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	19 = 15 BS 4 SS	17	2		
3.	ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES	5 = 2 BS $3 SS$	4	1		
4.	TRAINEES	13 = 8 BS 5 SS	12	1		
5.	TRAINERS	4 = 2BS 2SU	4			
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	13 = 8 BS 5 SS	11	1	1	
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	10 = 6 BS $4 SS$	10			
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	12 = 6 BS 6 SS	10	1	1	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4 = 1 BS 3 SS	2	2		
	Total:	89 = 57 BS 32 SS	79	8	2	

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme

Attachment 2

N 0.	Names of documents	number	Date approved
1.	EMCD by discipline	4	February 3, 2021
2.	Contracts with clinical practice bases	8	No. 36 01.02.2021 No. 6 10.04.02018 No. 6 01.02.2021 No. 4 10.04.02018 No. 3 01.02.2021 No. 1 02/01/2021 No. 3 10.04.02018 g No. 1 04/10/2018
3.	Catalog of elective disciplines for the 2020-2021 academic year	1	09/02/2020
4.	IEP of student	1	09/01/2020
5.	Catalog: Checklists for assessing practical skills in interim assessments.	1	No. 3 January 2019
6.	Circle plans (SRW) of clinical disciplines and work	4	09/01/2020 09/05/2020
7.	List of students of the programmes of the specialty "General Medicine" participating in the SRW for the 2020-2021 academic year (diplomas, diplomas, certificates)	1	
8.	Works of methodical exhibitions of teachers	7	23.11.2018 05.10.2019 09/10/2020 03.03.2019 05.10.2019 05.11.2020 02/03/2021
9.	Provision of literature in the specialty "General Medicine"	1	Signed by the head of the library.
10.	Application for 2020-2021 academic year for equipping offices	1	Signed by the head of the TCS
11.	The work plan of the TCS for the 2020-2021 academic year.	1	03.09.2020
12.	TCS jamming protocol for the 2020-2021 academic year.	1	03.09.2020
13.	Schedule of additional classes and consultations	2	03.09.2020
14.	Personal file of the teacher of special disciplines	1	
15.	Student satisfaction questionnaire at MTB	1	09/10/2019
16.	Graduates Satisfaction Questionnaire	2	09/10/2019
17.	Individual teacher plan	4	09/05/2020
18.	Practice work programmes	4	09/05/2020
19.	Diary-report on the passage of the student's PP	1	
20.	Employer survey	1	09/10/2020

List of documents requested by EEC members during the period of external expert evaluation

21.	The plan of educational work of the curators of the department "general medicine"	2	03.09.2020
22.	Dual education contracts	3	No 105 in 12/29/2018 No. 131 10/14/2019 No. 23A 01/17/2020.

Attachment 3

	program		Evaluation			
Standard	Criteria for evaluation Number of standards = BS * / SU		Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	9 = 9 BS 0 SU	9			
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM	19 = 15 BS 4 SS	17	2		
3.	ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES	5 = 2 BS $3 SS$	4	1		
4.	TRAINEES	13 = 8 BS 5 SS	12	1		
5.	TRAINERS	4 = 2BS 2SU	4			
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	13 = 8 BS 5 SS	11	1	1	
7.	PROGRAM EVALUATION	10 = 6 BS $4 SS$	10			
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	12 = 6 BS 6 SS	10	1	1	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4 = 1 BS 3 SS	2	2		
	Total:	89 = 57 BS 32 SS	79	8	2	

Quality profile and external assessment criteria (generalization) of the educational programme